

**Attendees:**

Mike	Pretious	Queen Margaret University	HE TSN Convenor
John	Salter	Independent Sustainability Consultant	FE TSN Convenor
Rebecca	Petford	EAUC	Coordinator
Peter	Bell	Perth College	
Craig	Cathcart	Queen Margaret University	
Eileen	Cook	SRUC	
Gillian	Gibson	EAUC	
Betsy	King	Learning for Sustainability Scotland	
Ron	Mackay	Edinburgh College	
Emma	Platt	Carbon Centre	
Andrew	Samuel	University of Abertay	
Martin	Webb	Edinburgh College	
Rehema	White	University of St Andrews	

1.	<p><b>Welcome and introductions</b>  <i>Mike Pretious, Education for Sustainable Development in Higher Education Topic Support Network Convenor</i></p> <p>Mike welcomed everyone to the combined HE and FE meeting and invited everyone to introduce themselves.</p>
<p><b>END OF THE UN DECADE OF EDUCATION FOR SUSTAINABLE DEVELOPMENT</b></p>	
2.	<p><b>UN Decade of ESD in Scotland: What’s Next for Further and Higher Education?</b>  <i>Rehema White and Betsy King, Learning for Sustainability Scotland</i></p> <p>Presentation available <a href="#">here</a>.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• UN goals for the UN Decade of Education for Sustainable Development (UNDESD) were about making education for sustainability better but Scotland had more particular goals for 2005-14 – this session will reflect on these and what was achieved and what will be next globally and for Scotland</li> <li>• Scotland’s UNDESD Goals for Further and Higher Education – we discussed this at the start and envisage a Scotland where:             <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Universities and colleges play a key role in developing knowledge and understanding of sustainable development (SD)</li> <li>2. Estates embody the principles of SD and encourage learners and staff to act sustainably</li> <li>3. ESD is integrated into the curricula</li> <li>4. The whole experience contributes to sustainability literacy, citizenship, attitudes and</li> </ol> </li> </ul>

behaviours

5. HE and FE has access to high quality materials, advice and support to embed SD into courses and student experiences
  6. Value of sustainability skills recognised by institutions, learners and employers
- Did we meet our goals? Captured feedback through Delphi process, with in HE all thinking some progress, and with HE one optimist, one pessimist, and most thinking some progress
  - We thought this was a pessimistic message – but we focused on the progress rather than the expectations not met at the Scotland End of DESD Conference
  - The conference said:
    - we need to continue building on the success of estates, curriculum and community in a holistic approach
    - LfS will increase through the level of student demand
    - LfS needs to be explored in terms of its impact on education overall
    - It is important to maintain a global perspective
  - Then we went to Japan for the end of the UNDESD in November 2014 for celebrations and planning, where there were many mini conferences, including Regional Centres of Expertise (RCE), Higher Education and Teacher Education conferences to share experiences and submit a declaration to the Ministers' Conference
  - A 'Global Action Programme' (GAP) was adopted by the UN and finally accepted and a roadmap launched at the conference
  - This is linked to the new SD goals which are being developed for beyond the Millenium Development Goals in 2015, but it isn't clear how.
  - The timeline also isn't clear for the roadmap, could be five years or longer.
  - What is Scotland's role in the GAP? Also unclear.
  - UNDESD Final Report November 2014 – 'Shaping the Future We Want' reviewing the decade at <http://bit.ly/1AfjAJt> - Scotland mentioned 4 times (represented by LfSS) around leadership. The UK don't appear to have answered the survey.
  - Report highlights a number of successes, including the number of countries with SD in education plans, multi-stakeholder approaches, ESD in discourses on Quality Education, and an increase in Universities seeking to influence beyond the University, particularly local communities. Challenges are to develop closer alignment and coherence across education and SD sectors, increase political support for institutionalised ESD and develop better knowledge to support effective ESD
  - UNDESD Report Key Findings included educators being a major priority and increasing significance of Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) – similar to our colleges but includes school level and beyond formal education too – in promoting ESD ideas
  - On HE - '*global transformation of HE towards SD has yet to occur*' – p.31 – there is a need for whole institution approaches to curriculum change and capacity building for leaders – no university is yet truly 'green' and transformed by ESD in the world but Europe and North America are good at showing action on the ground
  - Networks are an important part of making this happen in HE, where we need communities of practice to take this forward – this is relevant to the EAUC
  - Findings in TVET show that the Green Skills agenda is being recognised, but national and local implementation is slow. In the future governments, business and industry and educators need to work together and there needs to be capacity building for leaders and educators. This is similar to HE but focusing on the opportunity for skills development
  - UNESCO World Conference on ESD – 1100 people and 74 Ministers (none from UK or Scotland but message of support from Scottish Minister) – had four main themes:
    - Celebrating a decade of action
    - Reorientating education to build a better future for all

- Accelerating action for SD
- Setting the agenda for 2014 and beyond
- The Aichi-Nagoya Declaration (<http://bit.ly/1CF0rWe>) said we need to upscale and change policies, values, knowledge, purpose, teaching methods etc. and to maintain, increase and link the momentum across education and action
- Launch of Global Action Programme on ESD (GAP) – objectives are to reorient education and learning to give everyone the skills to contribute to sustainable development and strengthen learning and education agendas promoting ESD
- Roadmap for implementing GAP has 5 main cross-cutting areas at all levels of education:
  - Advancing policy
  - Transforming learning and training environments
  - Building capacities of trainers and educators
  - Empowering and mobilising young
  - Accelerating sustainable solutions at a local level
- Sets out a Global Agenda but it is up to national governments to implement and monitor it. There is a desire to set up partner networks of governments in each of the 5 areas.
- LfSS want to ensure Scotland is seeing its place in these networks
- Discussions of a Global Forum, a UNESCO prize for ESD, and the establishment of a GAP Secretariat at UNESCO (the only resources the UN are providing)
- UNESCO is urging national ESD co-ordination and action plans with targets – we hope Scotland will see this as important
- What next for FE and HE in Scotland? Scotland is doing well but needs more leadership and political will in Universities
- FE thoughts from LfSS – established curriculum, leading on from CfE and eco-schools; regulate and embed through certification requirements?
- HE thoughts from LfSS – research and teaching; no set curriculum and fierce defence of academic freedom; pursue via graduate attributes, critical thinking and innovative pedagogies?
- Questions to address: What are the opportunities to strengthen ESD in FE and HE now? What are the barriers? What resources do we need to enable us as individuals, institutions and a sector to develop?

Questions:

- *Who were the leaders in terms of ESD?*

Depended on the sector – in HE Europe and North America were coming through as actually walking the walk. Narrowing down too much is a danger because of the data used. They have given examples such as GUPES (Global Universities Partnership on the Environment and Sustainability) and focused on networks not institutions. Scotland came out really well and as one of the leading countries, but partly because of the success in schools and also communities. Less so in HE expect perhaps a few specialist curricula.

HEFCE was recognised as providing leadership – they had a strategy and action plan – but change in government changed things

HEA activities and student involvement also highlighted in the report

There are places in the UK that have made some good changes but in many cases the focus has been on Estates. However Plymouth model of curriculum, campus, community has been taken up in several places.

## EDUCATION FOR SUSTAINABILITY AND TERTIARY EDUCATION

### 3. The QAA HEA Publication and ESD – Reflections from Abertay University

*Andy Samuel, Abertay University*

Presentation available [here](#).

- Discussing the recently published (June 2014) document by the QAA and HEA on Education for Sustainable Development and how that relates to work at Abertay. Colleague Alastair Robertson was one of the authors but couldn't be with us today, but his means we are now looking at this in a meaningful way at Abertay.
- A lot of work done by HEFC was then taken up by HEA and QAA to draw up this document. It is small and readable, talking about what is involved but doesn't really tell you how to get things done.
- SFC have been marginal on some of the ESD discussions – HEFC have been a bit better
- It would be great if some of the work of HEA to support this such as workshops could be brought to Scotland – perhaps supported by LfSS and EAUC
- Talks to interdisciplinarity and developing understandings and attributes as well as skills and knowledge in its definition of ESD
- Four key themes (Global citizenship, Environmental stewardship, Social justice, ethics and well-being, and Future thinking) are cross-referenced with 3 Graduate Outcomes (Knowledge and understanding, Skills, Attributes)
- Useful document for those who haven't been involved in ESD before but does fall short in terms of an actual plan
- Abertay have just changed in terms of leadership and are looking reflexively on what they are doing and the ESD agenda seemed to be something they could look at as a way forward pedagogically as well as what is going on on campus
- The Abertay Experience is a good way to unite ideas going on with ESD
- There is a heritage in Scottish Higher Education which has always been copied elsewhere – the Scottish electorate is more supportive of HE than in England
- George Elder Davie and his ideas of Democratic intellect and the Generalist Tradition (interdisciplinary and ensuring these skills get out into the world and engage with the public at large) chimes with global citizenship, active citizenship, criticality etc.
- Patrick Geddes – Dundee just awarded City of Design and it's his ideas that helped win it – he believed education was a catalyst for social change and active citizenship, with his educational philosophy being a civics of 'hand, heart and head'
- Civics as a whole institutional approach at Abertay University – the new Abertay University Teaching and Learning Enhancement Strategy is 'A distinctive, transformational Abertay student experience' and is partly based on a new set of Abertay Attributes which involve the staff and community not just those who graduate. These are influenced by Geddes hand, heart and head idea, with an active citizen sphere with 3 interlocking rings of intellectual, personal and professional. Not entirely sure where this will go but it is interesting!
- Abertay are also looking at individual modules and developing electives similar to Aberdeen, St Andrews, Edinburgh, Glasgow etc. Possibility of a first year module on sustainability as part of a suite of electives around civics called 'Innovating, Locally, Transforming Globally: Sustainable Development in the Twenty First Century'. This will involve the community as well as tutors, with people both coming in and going out. Involves a field trip element around the global/local element, with the whole module embracing this through the idea of Civics.
- Learning and Teaching Scotland in 2002 in a paper about Citizenship (fed into CfE) talked

about political participation as members of a democratic state to affect the welfare of communities.

- Civics also appeared in the development of the CfE according to the government, but hasn't yet informed HE and FE on a pedagogical level. Mike Russell, the former Cabinet Secretary for Education and Life Long Learning tried but it wasn't embraced. Now there is a new Secretary so we'll need to see what happens.
- No general overarching philosophy on the pedagogy of what is going on in different institutions.
- Geddes took people to the Camera Obscura to the top floor first to view Edinburgh, then went down different levels to read and hear more about Scotland, then Europe, then the World. We need to introduce our students to ideas at all levels and not forget the local, and encourage reflection globally on what they see at the local level
- Regionally – with Dundee and St Andrews – looking at applying these ideas to ESD and developing shared resources, and would like to involve colleges and schools as well
- Fourth year students developing a number of events to explore more about ESD, which will help inform the module which will come up in August
- There are a lot of barriers ahead, including antagonism from senior managers in Universities and the wider country
- It's clear out there in Scotland that something is going on, and it's easy to get community involved, and they are thinking globally and acting locally. Our courses need to capture some of this.

#### Questions and Comments:

- *When did universities make degrees so narrow?*  
In 1996 there was a rule that meant that they were thinking about employability
- *There are jobs in some areas such as plumbing – why not train people for that?*  
Agreed, but we need to skill people for the world and not plan that any singular job will last a lifetime
- *Talk mentioned a perceived antipathy towards sustainability, but the Queen Margaret University Principal asked Craig Cathcart to refresh sustainability at the institution at all 3 levels, so antipathy is not everywhere. However there can be resourcing challenges.*
- *How are you going to do gap analysis on what is going on and what is needed within Abertay?*  
Doing this in relation to a number of events next year and will talk to tutors and see what the university does, but also want this to be driven by the community
- *Why is this going to be an elective module?*  
New strategy coming in of electives for first and second year, with some of the others talking to sustainability too. Would like to see this happening more across the board too. The opportunities are fantastic but Management are reacting to the situation from the agenda in Scotland more widely
- *Expectations and vocabulary of students coming in is also driving a need for sustainability*
- *Audit tool from LfSS for using across courses for development or creation of courses is being trialled now by Moray House at the University of Edinburgh by the Postgraduate secondary department, and is a generic tool which could also be used within Universities*
- *This ties in with LiFE from the EAUC, and it would be good to look at the two together*
- *We need a tool that will look at the synthesis between different areas, and will only use life if it helps us do something*

4.	<p><b>Sustainability as a Teaching Theme at Queen Margaret University (QMU)</b>  <i>Mike Pretious, Queen Margaret University</i></p> <p>Presentation available <a href="#">here</a>, reporting on work by Mike Pretious and Laurie Blair.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Context – ESD is a core HEA enhancement theme, embedded in QMU’s Quality Enhancement Learning Teachers Approaches (QELTA) strategy, and ESD is an important focus for the Scottish Government.</li> <li>• Primary research on ESD in the QMU curriculum was funded by Project for the Enhancement of Teaching and Learning (PETL)</li> <li>• The research looked for evidence of discussions of sustainability from across the three pillars of sustainability at different levels of the curriculum</li> <li>• Methodology – textual analysis of module and programme documentation for sustainability, CSR, environment etc. Now doing targeted interviews with those who have association with sustainability within the curriculum, and looking towards developing case studies of best practice.</li> <li>• Summary – over 80 modules contain some reference to relevant wording (around 25% of examined modules), mostly within School of Arts, Social Sciences and Management (ASSaM). The researchers recognise some limitations to the study but this seems reasonable. References appear most strongly within Business, Enterprise and Magagement, and Media, Communication and Performing Arts, with an important cluster within the School of Health Sciences Institution for International Health and Development (a stand-alone institute which focuses on research and postgraduate teaching)</li> <li>• Highlights – include 6 modules looking at sustainability specifically, e.g. 60 credit ‘Community Impact and Practice Module’ at MSc International Management and Leadership which involves dealing with people on the ground working on sustainability, the MSc Gastronomy ‘The System: from Field to Market’ module which is a really good example of a focused sustainability module addressing interdisciplinary, two in BA International Hospitality and Tourism Management, one in BA Events Management, and the whole MSc Social Justice Development and Health Programme is built around sustainability with a number of relevant modules (with a social focus)</li> <li>• Concluding observations: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Team were encouraged by the recognition that the key tenets of sustainability are within core more modules, and the breadth of sustainability and triple bottom line links are understood and taught</li> <li>- Tendency for specialised sustainability modules tend to be level 9 or above (latter stages of degrees) – we put the basic disciplines in early then bring criticality in later – should we be starting earlier?</li> </ul> </li> <li>• Something will come out in more detail later on this research</li> <li>• Presenting a poster at Plymouth in the new year at the ESD conference</li> </ul> <p>Questions and Comments:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>How did you decide the themes to search for?</i> We used our personal judgement when we went through documents, not restricted to certain words</li> <li>• <i>Abertay are trying to look at what themes would be in developing their module</i></li> <li>• <i>Are the students and staff aware they are being taught these things?</i> Yes, but modules differ in terms of how much they think it is a key component of what they</li> </ul>



	are teaching and how much they include
5.	<p><b>Social Sustainability: Beyond Carbon – Increasing the dialogue between Colleges and Universities on Education for Sustainable Development</b></p> <p><i>John Salter, Education for Sustainable Development in Further Education Topic Support Network Convenor</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• John has completed the UN Decade college project and the report is soon to be distributed</li> <li>• What has really happened in the college sector over the decade?</li> <li>• In the last 10 years there has been a change in our understanding of sustainable development – not just seen to be about the environment any more</li> <li>• What is the benefit to the Scottish Economy if we give a young person a skill they can use rather than them needing care their whole lives? Never calculated</li> <li>• Realised later in his working life he wanted parity of esteem between the University and College sectors – achievements of learners with additional support needs should be equal to those with any other qualification, as once a person reaches their full potential that should be equal to another achieving a PhD. The Scottish Government agree and have a lot of policies around this, but we still consider college qualifications to be lower.</li> <li>• Colleges are not mini-universities, they are independent and deliver on a range of issues, not just degrees or getting people to University</li> <li>• Colleges are also hubs in the community, such as a library, café etc – this has been the case for a long time, and already being done at the start of the UNDESD. John believes this contributed to the achievements of the UNDESD in Scotland.</li> <li>• End of decade has brought changes to colleges with mergers fracturing relationships, then Scottish Government cut college places by 30,000 to give that money to ensuring free Higher Education. John feels strongly this money needs to be returned.</li> <li>• The work we did on ESD was a great success but was seriously marred by this</li> <li>• SQA has been exemplary in some areas, with unit writers including the term sustainable development where possible, but could do more</li> <li>• New sustainable awards are now essential to have to ensure future-proof knowledge, such as ‘sustainable resource management’ at SFSQ6, but Colleges aren’t taking these up</li> <li>• Businesses take on a lot of the work and subscribe to a lot of awards across all pillars of sustainability (some businesses are now recognising that sustainability is not an optional extra but essential to survive), and businesses have the government’s ear and if they ask for things they might happen. Business is already helping drive some change.</li> <li>• It will be 2-3 years until colleges sort themselves out with or without more funding</li> <li>• The further education sector needs to link sustainability teaching to vocations – we train people to job roles, and sustainability is more interesting if their additional knowledge adds more to their certificate</li> <li>• Graduations are now only for higher level students in colleges, which doesn’t reward those capable of less, and is undermining many vocational programmes</li> </ul> <p>Questions and Comments:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Martin Webb: Some great work is going on at Universities and as new to the college sector I sometimes feel out of my depth, but a lot of what John said does chime. There is a lot going on we don’t badge as sustainability, and it’s my job to develop Education for Sustainable Development. What framework will tell me what I need to do on a practical day-to-day level?</li> <li>• Betsy King: There was no college input to LfSS end of decade presentation as it is just starting to emerge there but there are not many snips of video to highlight it. Pupils from</li> </ul>

	<p>schools bring an understanding of sustainability and colleges now have to put it within hairdressing or construction, and John’s work has helped to initiate that. The Green Economy and skills requirement, as well as student interest, are driving change.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• John Salter: Scotland outside the EU would be in trouble, we are failing to fill jobs and not matching people to jobs</li> <li>• Andy Samuel: Mechanisms could be in place for Universities to support regionalisation and the ESD agenda within it</li> <li>• John Salter: Most units in the formal curriculum now reference sustainability thanks to a few SQA champions, and hope is that Curriculum for Excellence awards will progress up through Further Education. There are high University drop-out rates too – we need to help people do what suits them. HNC land management tend to do better than those with degrees! Regionalisation has made colleges more like Higher Education institutions – some suggest do a 1<sup>st</sup> or 2<sup>nd</sup> year certificate instead of HNCs and HNDs – but HNCs and HNDs are graded which is important.</li> <li>• Andy Samuel: Outcome Agreements for tertiary education are meant to ensure what colleges and universities achieve at a local level, and could be a way in for ESD</li> <li>• Rehema White: The employability debate is seen as negative in Universities, but I prefer the word ‘vocation’ used earlier, as it is about achieving potential rather than employability being about suiting what the employer wants</li> <li>• John Salter: Universities need to put more emphasis on work experience, and should learn this from the College sector</li> <li>• Mike Pretious: There is a business desire for ESD from graduates because of demand for organisations to focus on sustainability from recent graduates, as well as the wider business environment</li> <li>• John Salter: We need to cut oil use for prioritisation as well as the climate. Businesses know this is coming and they need to prepare themselves for an uncertain future.</li> <li>• Ron Mackay: Although the SQA writers are asked to consider sustainability perhaps this is not strong enough and it is still down to the individual lecturer to include it</li> <li>• Craig Cathcart: Higher Education Outcome Agreements may ask you to reflect your local pattern of activity but this is to allow central control and means a loss of autonomy. Reporting on sustainability is also very narrow and often just about emissions, we need a wider definition of sustainability to be discussed</li> <li>• John Salter: Lots of brilliant things are being done but aren’t being recorded</li> </ul>
6.	<p><b>EAUC ESD Topic Support Networks and Learning for Sustainability Scotland</b></p> <p>Discussion:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Currently the EAUC ESD Topic Support Networks for Further and Higher Education work with the LfSS Task Groups for Further and Higher Education, and we need to establish more clearly how this relationship works</li> <li>• There is no desire to compete and ideas should be shared, but the EAUC TSNs and Task Groups overlap – should we merge or are they different?</li> <li>• Rehema White (LfSS) thinks they are different but synergistic</li> <li>• A TSN is a long standing network of people working in or interest in that area, which is good at getting people together and having online resources and sharing</li> </ul>



	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Task Groups are shorter lived and get together within a set group with an aim to do a particular task</li> <li>• May be an overlap at some point where people work together</li> <li>• So TSNs and Task groups work together but don't overlap</li> <li>• Currently the Task Group is identifying areas for action, and once identified a group would be established. This may arise out of a TSN meeting.</li> <li>• Currently this network therefore consists of two Topic Support Networks – HE and FE.</li> <li>• The partnership with LfSS is vital to these groups and they should be invited to all meetings</li> <li>• EAUC online information will be changed to make the partnership with LfSS clear.</li> </ul>
7.	<p><b>Summary and Close</b>  <i>Mike Pretious, Education for Sustainable Development in Higher Education Topic Support Network Convenor</i></p> <p>Mike thanked everyone for their attendance and input.</p> <p>The next Topic Support Network Meeting for both HE and FE will be in Spring 2015.</p>

Minutes Prepared by Rebecca Petford  
EAUC Scotland Programme Coordinator  
9<sup>th</sup> December 2014